



**PAKISTAN MAHIGEER TAHREEK**

The Movement of the Indigenous Coastal Fisherfolk Communities of Pakistan

## Development to Destroy Nature and Displace People

(Waterfront Development on Hawksbay)



**Naseer Memon  
and  
Zubaida Birwani**



September 2007

In September 2006, Federal Government announced construction of Diamond Bar Island City on two islands i.e. Bundaar and Dingi on Karachi coast. A hefty investment of \$ 43 billion was promised by a UAE based real estate concern Emaar. Concerned citizens of Sindh, civil society and political organizations of Pakistan and international conservation groups termed this project a threat to natural resources of Sindh Coast and livelihood of fishing communities in the vicinity. The project sparked a new controversy on development scene of the country. However it did not stop here and the government decided to embark upon its ambitious waterfront development plan in Karachi. Nascent civil society is still struggling with decades old strong vested interest, always ready to bulldoze all norms and laws in the name of development. The latest in the line is ecologically rich Hawksbay area on the western coast of Karachi. This greed driven paradigm of development is being projected as a sign of investor confidence in the country and the government is eager to offer red carpet welcome to every foreign investor. The ultra rich dominated socio-political structure of Pakistan has been a major beneficiary of bad governance, weak civil society and absence of social justice in country, which offers fertile ground to amass more wealth with every passing moment. Waterfront development is just another money making venture of the same corridors.

## **1. The Project**

As usual government has not yet officially disclosed the details of the project. However media has been leaking some information on the project through news stories. Official websites of City District Government Karachi (CDGK) and the Limitless (Dubai based real estate developer involved in the project) also provide some information on the project.

According to the official website of the CDGK, the City Nazim of Karachi Syed Mustafa Kamal told journalists that master plan to construct a new city ‘Karachi Waterfront Sugar Land City’ at Hawkesbay has been finalized and it will be constructed on 60,000 acre with the estimated cost of US\$68 billion. Responding a question, the Nazim said the President General Pervez Musharraf has approved the plan and this project will be a biggest project in the country to provide job opportunity to millions of people. He added the concerned authorities have been issued NOC for the construction of new city at Hawkesbay. The meeting was also attended by federal minister for shipping Babar Ghori, Chief Minister Sindh, chief secretary Sindh, KPT chairman, representative of Nakheel Development and Chief Executive of Dubai Islamic Bank.

The website of Limitless explains the salient features of the project as under:

“The project is a joint initiative of Limitless and the Government of Pakistan to create a new, balanced waterfront development - Karachi Waterfront, on a 25,000 hectares site west of the existing city of Karachi. The “new city” would contain a defined and carefully weighted balance of residential, commercial, recreational and entertainment facilities in state of the art, master-planned communities. The development would also be home to Special Economic Zones creating a hub for trading, manufacturing and services industry supported by world-class infrastructure and amenities. Phase-1 of the project will involve an investment of \$20 billion over the next ten years for developing more than 2000 hectares of prime water-front property. Subsequent phases of the project are expected to involve much larger investments.”

A report in Daily The News, Karachi appeared on 25th May 2007, provides following details about the project.

“The first announcement of the project came on Dubai World’s website on 5th June, 2006, where it stated that Limitless will develop the Karachi Waterfront project. This was followed by the news that a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) has been signed by Pakistan’s Minister of State and Privatization

and Investment Umar Ahmad Ghuman and Dubai World chairman Sultan Bin Sulayman. The (MoU) was followed by a high-level meeting held in Islamabad on June 24, 2006, which was chaired by Prime Minister Shaukat Aziz. A number of important directives were given to different ministries including those of Ports and Shipping, Defence, as well as the government of Sindh. It was decided in this meeting that, since the area indicated by Dubai World is very large, the development may start in phases. According to the documents available, in the first phase Manora area, along with Sandspit and areas behind it in the Karachi Port Trust (KPT) western back waters, up to KPT's land limits with Hawksbay, would be offered to the group. In the second phase, while developing the Hawksbay Beach front, it would be ensured that a few portions are left open for the general public for recreational purposes. It was proposed in the same meeting that there should be a proper mechanism for shifting the navy and cantonment board's facilities located at Manora to the Navy land at Cape Monze area.

After the meeting, these directives were forwarded to the government of Sindh on 7th October, 2006. From here, the work gained momentum according to the dates provided in the documents. There were reminders from the District Coordination Officer (DCO) City District Government Fazlur Rahaman to Executive District Officer (EDO) revenue, CDGK. This reminder termed the directives from the Prime Minister to be of 'high priority'.

Throughout the above work, there has never been any 'official' announcement from the federal government related to the Sugarland City project. Nor were there any reports in the media related to this mega project. However, on 22nd February, 2007, City Nazim Syed Mustafa Kamal briefed journalists about the project and also gave details of the project being finalised with an agreement being signed in March 2007. It was also said that the project has the approval from the President. This was for the first time that the project was officially announced and got coverage by the media.

This project involves an area of 60,000 acres of area with a total investment of 68 billion US dollars that has been approved by the Federal government.

According to the latest reports on the project, notices have been issued to all those hut owners coming under the project's jurisdiction. The notice states that all those huts that are in violation of the hut by-laws would have their leases cancelled with immediate effect whereas the leases of those huts that are not in violation will not be renewed as and when their term expires."

On 14<sup>th</sup> August, the national day of Pakistan, the Planning and Development department of Sindh Government invited Expression of Interests for the project. The same advertisement was placed in Daily Dawn, Karachi on 29<sup>th</sup> August 2007, this time including a note on extent of project area as 40,000 acres centered around Hawksbay. The document however does not provide any specific details of the project.

## **2. Dubai, the Key Player in Waterfront Development**

UAE based real estate concerns are fast expanding their overseas investments after making wonders at home. UAE is known for its surplus capital earned through high scale commercial ventures and foreign investment. Past three decades have witnessed amazing real estate development in UAE specially in Dubai which has become a hub of commercial activities. Investors from all over the world are pouring money into Dubai's business ventures. This has given tremendous boost to real estate activity.

The UAE companies have covered almost whole of their shoreline with sky scrappers and even penetrated in shallow waters to extend its coastline with towering structures. In recent years waterfront development has emerged as a major investment ground for local companies. According to a CNN report on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2005, His Highness Sheikh Mohammed announced the launch of Dubai Waterfront, the world's largest waterfront development under the direction of Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al

Maktoum, the then Crown Prince of Dubai and UAE. The Dubai Waterfront is planned to cover an 81 million square metre beachfront. Destined to become an international landmark, Dubai Waterfront is the world's largest waterfront offering, and is located 35 km south west of Dubai, bordering Abu Dhabi, on the last remaining coastal waterfront of the Emirate. The Dubai Waterfront will extend Dubai's coastline by 820 kilometers, twelve times the length of its current coastline. It will consist of 440 square kilometers of water and land developments, an area seven times the size of Manhattan. It is expected to house 400,000 people. Dubai Marina, The Palm Jumeirah, The World and Jabel Ali are the jewels in the crown of waterfront development of Dubai, whose glittering pictures mark all around the local and international newspapers, billboards and websites. Local newspapers every day carry dozens of pages with advertisement of real estate ventures and this is probably the fastest thriving business in the area.

There is no dearth of capital in UAE. A booming economy and high oil revenues helped create 9,100 new millionaires (in dollars) in the UAE only last year, taking their total to 68,100 in UAE. This was revealed in 11<sup>th</sup> Annual World Wealth Report released on 27<sup>th</sup> June 2007. Likewise Saudi millionaires grew to 89,600 in the same year.

According to the same report “globally the number of people possessing \$1 million or more in investible assets rose 8.3 percent in 2006 to 9.5 million. Wealth of the world’s rich increased 11.4 percent to \$37.2 trillion last year. Dubai is one of the potential areas to invest this huge capital and the real estate is the most favorite funnel to pour the dollars in. Global direct real estate transaction volumes reached \$ 682 billion last year. In 2006 these millionaires shifted money into real estate at times liquidating some of their assets to fund these real estate opportunities. Global direct real estate transaction volumes reached \$682 billion in 2006, up by 38% from 2005”.

Possessing this scale of experience and capital, Dubai’s investors are now set to capture new coasts. After accumulating wealth and acquiring experience, Dubai’s companies are now exploring new shores to multiply their fortune. Waterfront development is a major area of their interest and Pakistan in the immediate neighborhood seems an ideal place with long virgin shores and investment thirsty government.

According to a CNN report on 1<sup>st</sup> June 2006, Dubai World, Dubai’s largest holding company is planning to invest projects worth \$10 billion in Pakistan across different industries including infrastructure development, industrial and real estate projects. This includes the construction of a modern waterfront off the Karachi coastline, besides the development and management of Pakistani ports. An announcement to this effect was made in a ceremony in Islamabad in the presence of His Highness Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al Maktoum, Vice President and Prime Minister of the UAE and Ruler of Dubai, and Mr. Shaukat Aziz, Prime Minister of Pakistan.

During the ceremony, two agreements were signed between UAE and Pakistan - the first aimed at developing infrastructure and building commercial and industrial real estate projects. The second agreement was targeted at building free zones and modern ports which will be managed by DP World, the region's leading port and terminal operators.

Sultan Ahmed Bin Sulayem, Executive Chairman of Dubai Ports, Customs and Free Zone Corporation and Chairman of Nakheel, signed the agreements with the Pakistani Minister of Transport and Minister of Foreign Investments.

Commenting on the agreements, Sultan Ahmed Bin Sulayem said: 'Dubai World is targeting massive investments in various sectors including real estate projects in main cities across Pakistan. Dubai World, through Limitless Company - its international real estate development arm - will lead and execute investments in residential real estate sector as Pakistan lacks residential units of high quality. Limitless will bridge the gap through its expertise in the sector. In addition, Limitless will also develop real estate,

entertainment and commercial projects in different regions in Pakistan. 'Based on the extensive expertise we have in developing waterfronts, we will work on preparing detailed studies to build waterfront in Karachi - an integrated community that will be the first-of-its-kind in the Indian subcontinent. The development will encompass world-class residential and commercial buildings, shopping centres and entertainment facilities similar to the projects that Dubai is renowned to develop.'

Dubai Port World and the Pakistani government are now working closely to finalize the details of the agreements for the company to start managing and operating Qasim Port, one of the most important and active ports in Pakistan in order to develop its operations and modernize its systems to embrace the economic and trade growth currently being witnessed in Pakistan and to make it work according to international standards that Dubai is known for.

Prior to this in May 2006 Sultan Bin Sulayem, Chairman of Dubai World, met with the President of Pakistan, General Pervez Musharraf, in Islamabad to discuss potential areas of cooperation between Dubai World and Pakistan.

The two parties agreed to jointly explore investments in various fields, including real estate developments in major urban centers across Pakistan. Nakheel, a fully-owned subsidiary of Dubai World and the developer of several of Dubai's iconic projects such as the Palms, The World and Dubai Waterfront, will spearhead efforts on this front and explore investments in the residential, commercial and leisure real estate sectors in Pakistan. Dubai World and the Government of Pakistan also discussed potential cooperation and investment in other commercial activities including development and management of industrial infrastructure, including industrial parks and free zones, and development and operation of public sector infrastructure projects, including oil & gas related projects, airports and port and terminal management.

Speaking on the occasion, Sultan Bin Sulayem said "Pakistan is one of the world's fastest growing economies making it an attractive market for Dubai World. We have a close relationship with Pakistan and would like to further strengthen it by capitalizing on opportunities in the country. The Middle East has a huge potential investor base for investments into Pakistan.

President General Pervez Musharraf welcomed Sultan Bin Sulayem to Pakistan and promised to provide the full support of the Government to facilitate Dubai World's investments in the country. He was quoted as saying "We are delighted to welcome Dubai World to Pakistan and are very excited about the prospect of Dubai World undertaking major projects in the country.

This is how Dubai based companies have been making their entry in Pakistan in a big way during the recent years. Dubai World, Nakheel, Limitless and Dubai Islamic Bank are actively involved in furthering UAE's investment interests in Pakistan. These names have started appearing Pakistani media over recent years. A brief profile of each would give an idea of their future role in the country.

## **2.1 Dubai World**

Official website of Dubai World defines it in these words. "Dubai World was launched as one of the world's largest holding companies under the decree ratified on 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2006 by Sheikh Mohammed Bin Rashid Al Maktoum, Ruler of Dubai, UAE Vice President and Prime Minister. It was launched as world's leading holding companies, with over 45,000 employees in over 75 cities around the world.

Comprised of development, investment, marine services, commodities and ports and free zone divisions, Dubai World is a powerful growth engine with an unprecedented collection of companies including: DP World, P&O, Jafza, Dubai Drydocks, Maritime City, Dubai Multi Commodities Centre, Kerzner, One &

Only, Atlantis, Island Global Yachting, Limitless, Nakheel, Istithmar, Inchcape Shipping Services, Tejari, Technopark and Tamweel”.

Led by Sultan Ahmed Bin Sulayem, Dubai World was established to continue expanding Dubai's aggressive growth, domestically and abroad. It owns some iconic projects in Dubai like The Palm, extensive real estate investment in New York and London, unique hospitality destinations in every corner of the world, and a growing global port footprint from China to Peru.

## **2.2 Nakheel**

Nakheel is a UAE government owned corporation, founded in 1990. With its head quarter in Dubai, it now serves in 87 countries. In 2006 it generated revenue of 70 billion dollars and earned a net income of 15.8 billion dollars. It has 2000 employees on board.

Nakheel is a real estate developer in Dubai and creator of several land reclamation projects, including the Palm Islands, the Dubai Waterfront, and The World. Its residential projects include Jebel Ali Gardens, International City, Jumeirah Islands and Jumeirah Lake Towers. Its shopping projects include the Dragon Mart (At International City) and Ibn Battuta Mall. Its main competitor in residential development in Dubai is Emaar Properties.

Nakheel's flagship properties are the three man-made palm tree shaped islands on the coast of Dubai. Nakheel operates under the umbrella of Dubai World, which manages various businesses on behalf of the Dubai government.

## **2.3 Limitless**

Limitless, an off shoot of Nakheel was established in July 2005, with the key objective of diversifying and globalizing Dubai's portfolio by leveraging the know-how and exposure gained by Dubai World's real estate initiatives. Limitless LLC, a Dubai World Company, is an integrated global real estate developer. It lays claim to three specific areas of expertise that provide the company with a competitive advantage – master planning large urban communities, waterfront development and the implementation of large-scale balanced projects.

## **2.4 Dubai Islamic Bank**

Dubai Islamic Bank (DIB) was established in 1975. In the first half of 2007 its net profit rose to 1.5 billion UAE dirham (approx 24 billion rupees), an increase of 113 per cent compared to the corresponding period in 2006. Recently, DIB was ranked among the fastest-moving banks in the world for the second consecutive year in the annual Top 1,000 World Bank list published by 'The Banker' magazine.

In Pakistan it started its business in March 2005. A Dubai Islamic Bank (DIB) delegation led by Dr. Mohamed Khalfan bin Khirbash, UAE Minister of State for Finance and Industry and Chairman of DIB, announced the establishment of DIB Pakistan Limited, a wholly owned subsidiary of DIB, at a ceremony hosted by Pakistan Prime Minister Shaukat Aziz in Islamabad.

### **3. The Project Area**

According to the “Request for Proposal” (RFP) document issued by the Planning and Development Department along with inviting Expression of Interest, the project area is located around Hawksbay at western coastline of Karachi. In section-IV of the document, the geographical coverage has been vaguely described as “The Karachi Waterfront Development project comprises a large tract of land to be developed at western coastline of Karachi centered around Hawks Bay, Karachi Pakistan with an estimated available or to be made available land and measuring approximately 40,000 acres”. This does not suggest any specific location of the project.

This vagueness is also evident from the introductory note given in the beginning of the document. It reads “The approximate total land within the proposed area will be a minimum of 40,000 acres (19047.53 acres available Government of Sindh land, 21037.15 acres of land on short lease subject to cancellation) all of which is not contiguous. There are pockets of land in the proposed Development Area that are not owned by any government entity or agency, and the selected developer will be expected to work with the government entities and agencies and with the actual owners of the land to acquire or find other viable mutually-beneficial and mutual agreeable solutions for these pockets of land.” This clearly indicates that the project will be spread all around the Hawks Bay area and not restricted to any particular part of the area.

### **4. Threat to Eco-system**

Hawksbay homes the ecologically rich sandy beach Sandspit.. About five kilo meters long this sandy strip hosts unique eco-system of endangered green turtle. This is a major breeding point of the green turtle. Sindh Wildlife Department and World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF) has been working on conservation of green turtles since many years.

Marine turtles have been included in the WWF - Pakistan strategic plan known as ‘Species of Special Concern’. Globally, there are eight species of marine turtles and they are all have been classified as endangered. Green Turtle (*Chelonia mydas*) and Olive Ridley Turtle (*Lepidochelys olivacea*) are the two species of marine turtles that nest along the Sandspit and Hawkesbay beaches at the Karachi coast. All species of marine turtles are listed in the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES). Pakistan is a signatory to CITES, which prohibits trade of turtles, turtle parts and eggs. The Government of Sindh has also declared Marine Turtles as ‘Protected’ species. Mega construction schemes may not only disturb this fragile eco-system but may also completely devoid this area from green turtles if proper environmental management is not carried out.

In the backwaters, mangroves ecosystem provides resting place to a variety of migratory birds. Noisy construction work and enhanced vehicular movement will cause deterrence to migratory birds and they may abandon this area. The area owned by KPT has mangroves and vegetation cover spread over 400-500 hectares (over 1000 acres). The mangrove eco-system has multiple benefits including resting place for migratory birds and nursery for shrimp and several fish species. Local fishing communities also use these forests for fodder and fuel. Mangrove eco-system in Indus Delta is poorly managed and severely threatened. Projects like Diamond Bar and Sugar Land City can cause severe damage to this eco-system. In past KPT projects like Mai Kulachi road and other infrastructural work along the shore has caused severe damage to mangroves.

As appears from the RFP document, Waterfront development is not a single project but it is an amalgamation of several fragmented projects. It is worth mentioning here that the Karachi coast homes an integrated fragile and complex eco-system involving vanishing mangroves, dwindling fish species and fast disappearing migratory birds. Any development schemes of such scale would have potential negative

impact on its eco-system. Also these developments will have far reaching impacts on livelihood of coastal communities. These communities earn their livelihood through beach related leisure activities and subsistence fishing. The waterfront development is bound to bring drastic changes in their centuries old lifestyle. The project proponents are only making hollow claims of compensating and benefiting the local communities without giving any substantial details. Such type of development can have multifarious social environmental impacts.

The RFP document makes it obligatory to conduct Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) of the project. However it may be noted that the whole development package on Karachi Coast will have cumulative impact on coastal eco-systems. Therefore project based EIAs may not depict true picture of environmental and social impacts. It requires Strategic Impact Assessment (both social and environmental) to take holistic picture of likely impacts on natural resources and local communities. Although the Environmental Protection Act of 1997 calls for EIA of such projects but it is not in sight so far. Environmental regulation in the country and in Sindh particularly, is very weak. Environmental Protection Agency in Sindh is in shambles. A news story carried by daily Dawn (25<sup>th</sup> Sept 07) reveals the lack of qualified and trained people in Sindh EPA. Political intervention has reduced this organization to an in-effective entity. Knowing the capacity and credibility of environmental regulators in country, one can easily guess the degree of ease with which environmental rituals can be fulfilled by the mighty money masters.

## **5. Community Perspective**

Hawksbay is home to most under developed centuries old villages of fishing communities. Predominantly Sindhi and Balochi speaking communities are living in this area even before the British Raj. Manoro was the original Karachi, where a fort wall defined the boundary of Karachi at the time of British occupation in 1843.

Even after six decades of independence, these villages are deprived of very basic facilities. Infrastructure and other social sector services like drinking water, health and education are in its worst shape. Presently there are two union councils on the Hawks bay, namely Gabo Pat and Baba Island. The Gabo Pat Union Council has more than 100 goths, some of them more than a century old. Total population in this union council is over one hundred thousand people. Some of the villages have sizable population like Abdul Rehman goth (8,000) and Faqeer Mohammad goth (3000). There are 9 Dehs in the union council. Only two dehs (Lal Bakhar and Gound Pas) have water supply system, that too not reliable. Remaining seven dehs have no any drinking water facility provided by the city government. They occasionally receive water tankers. Out of 8 Basic Health Units only one is properly functioning, another is partially functional and all others do not function. Local communities have very limited transport facilities to reach the heart of city. Only two buses ply every day to commute people to Lea Market.

Baba Island Union Council comprises of three big islands namely Baba Island (16,000 population), Bhit Island (12,000 population) and Shams Pir Island (3,000 population). There are some large villages like Younisabad (3,500 population) and Kaka Pir (1,000 people). Centuries old Islands and villages in this union council are also deprived of basic human needs such as drinking water. It is strange that the government never concentrated to develop these old heirs of Karachi and kept them in centuries old state of life. Local communities of Hawksbay area have not been consulted on the project and no information has been shared with them. The centuries old villages are now feared to be dislodged.

Hawksbay is among the most beautiful resort places in the country. Thousands of visitors frequent beautiful locations such as Cap Mounz, French Beach and Paradise Point on the Hawksbay. Once the city of rich is erected, no common man would have easy access to these charming views of nature. This will



also deprive hundreds of daily wage earners at these picnic points. A number of huts constructed in the area would also be demolished. These huts are owned by some individuals and private companies. Local people are hired as caretakers on these huts. If these huts are removed and people stopped visiting picnic points, several hundred local villagers will lose their livelihood resources.

Local communities have genuine concerns that they would be dislodged from their ancestral abodes to pave the way for constructing the modern city. According to a report of Urban Resource Centre, Karachi more than 23,575 houses (excluding houses and shops demolished in the Lyari riverbed due to the Lyari Expressway Project) have been bulldozed by various government agencies since 1992. As a result of these evictions 185,801 people have been displaced. During the period of Jan – May 2006, the government bulldozed over 3,490 houses in the various parts of the city. A total of 23,124 people were made homeless as result of these evictions. In recently implemented mega projects of Layari Expressway about 25,000 families have been displaced. Majority of them is suffering on many accounts such as compensation, resettlement, loss of employment and breakage of social relations.

As appears from the official documents, the project requires 40,000 acres of land the government has only 19047.53 acres available, that too is not contiguous. This indicates that over 21,000 acres of land would need to be managed in different parts and this may result in non-volunteer displacement of poor communities. The project document has indicated towards this in sugar coated language “There are pockets of land in the proposed Development Area that are not owned by any government entity or agency, and the selected developer will be expected to work with the government entities and agencies and with the actual owners of the land to acquire or find other viable mutually-beneficial and mutual agreeable solutions for these pockets of land”.

Such fears become more acute in absence of any sharing/consultation with local communities. It has become almost a norm in the country to keep information about all big projects confidential from citizens particularly the potential affectees. In this case also all plans are being made behind the close doors and local communities are still unaware of the project and its likely impacts. No consultation with civil society or local communities has been conducted and every thing is shrouded in mystery. This attitude towards development creates genuine concerns among the citizens about these initiatives.

## **6. History of Development on Karachi Coast**

Historical facts reveal that the modern Karachi has been developed at the cost of livelihood of fishing communities. The process started before partition and gained momentum after partition. With rapid influx of population from India, whole landscape of the city went through drastic changes. Major development initiatives along the coasts such as Port Qasim, Fish Harbors, Steel Mill and various phases of Defence Housing Society, all took the toll of natural resources of coastal communities. The proponents of these projects promised employment and other benefits to affected communities but ended up with only marginalizing coastal villages. Coastal communities have bitter experience of development activities.

A recently published book “Karachi Sindh Jee Marui”, authored by Mr. Gul Hassan Kalmati narrates the plight of coastal communities in the wake of major development projects. According to the author, in 1974, Pakistan Steel Mill was founded. 18,660 acres of land were acquired from 500 land owners and 200 lease holders. About 15 villages were swollen by the mill, namely Syed Mahmood Shah, Ahmed Gabol, Thaenr Gabol, Haji Amir Ali, Saatal Jokhio, Achar Jokhio, Shaikh Jokhio, Dur Mohammad Jokhio, Soomar Kalmati, Alu Khaskheli, Soofan Gabol, Haji Natho Kalmati, Haji Meenhan Wasayo and Khanto goth. These villages were rich in pastures, livestock and fisheries. Affectees were offered one rupee per squire yard for owned land, 1500 rupees for a pacca house and 600-1000 rupees for katcha house. Affectees approached the court, which decreed in their favor and new rates were announced but villagers were never paid the same. Till 1974 some 25,000 regular and more than 4000 temporary staff was

employed in the Mill. Displaced villagers were only 35 among them and now reduced to 16 only. Ministry of Production also issued a letter number PD/JSA/3076/79 on 16<sup>th</sup> May 1979 promising employment for local villagers but it never happened. A number of industrial units are operating in the area, having more than 30,000 employees but hardly two dozen local villagers are among them.

Port Qasim Authority is another empire built on the bulldozed remains of coastal villages. The Port was inaugurated in 1975. At that time 20,000 acres land was acquired on coast and another 15,000 acres were acquired from Sindh government. The port erased 35 villages namely Mohammad Suleman, Haji Umeed Ali, Thoohar Panhwar, Jatan Jo Goth, All Bakhsh, Abdul Rehman, Misri Mohammad, Qasim, Mola Bakhsh Baloch, Abul Latif, Haji Mohammad Hassan, Khan Mohammad, Ashraf, Saanwan, Noor Mohammad, Shoukat Ali, Rahim Dino, Abdul Razaq, Nabi Bakhsh, Mehaar, Mevo, Ali Akber, Nawab Baloch, Karam Ali, Dinu, Mohammad Rahim, Aahmed Khan, Karam Khan, Ali Khan, Moorand Kalmati, Umed Ali Gabol, Mohammad Khan, Wasan Khan, Ghulam Mohammad and Allah Bachayo. Board of Revenue and the Port Qasim Authority signed an agreement on 11<sup>th</sup> May 1981 promising that all affectees will receive compensation and will be resettled before displacing them. However only one village received some compensation and the remaining 34 never received any benefit. From 1974 to 1990, the Port Authority employed 2200 persons; only 79 were from the affected villages. Port Qasim Authority ignored almost every agreement and instructions from Sindh government on local employment. The authority acquired villages for port activities but now the same land is being allotted to private concerns for commercial purposes. Hundreds of production units are operating on the same land but villagers never received any benefit of this development on their land. Now Port Qasim Authority is bent upon selling two islands Dingi and Bundaar to deprive fishing communities from their remaining sources of livelihood.

These are only the glimpses from the long story of injustice meted out to coastal communities ever since the country appeared on globe. Being marginalized and politically weak the peaceful villagers of coast have always been made the victim of development. This history of ruthless development has created a sense of insecurity among the coastal communities ever since they have heard the drumbeat of new development.

## **7. Development Ethics**

The concept of Triple Bottom Line is a corner stone of sustainable development. Any development initiative which prefers only one “P” i.e. “profit” and ignore the other two i.e. “People” and “Planet” does not qualify the fundamentals of sustainable development. Sadly the waterfront development has all its focus on profits and there is no care for its impacts on people and nature. The concept of development ethics explains the reason for creating aforementioned balance. David Crocker of University of Maryland at College Park in his paper “International Development Ethics” explains this concept succinctly. “‘Development’ can be used both descriptively and normatively. In the descriptive sense, ‘development’ is usually identified as the processes of economic growth, industrialization, and modernization that result in a society's achieving a high (per capita) gross domestic product. So conceived, a ‘developed’ society may be either celebrated or criticized. In the normative sense, a developed society, ranging from villages to national and regional societies, is one whose established institutions realize or approximate (what the proponent believes to be) worthwhile goals—most centrally, the overcoming of economic and social deprivation”.

Regrettably most of the development projects in our country negate these basic definitions of modern concepts of development. The country carries the baggage of a terrible history of mega projects. Displacement of local communities, lack of appropriate resettlement and compensation plans coupled with massive corruption in compensation process, damage to eco-system and worsening social inequalities are only few of the many negative impacts of mega projects experienced in the country.

Tarbela Dam, Chotiari Dam and Left Bank Outfall Drain Project are only few examples to quote. Socio-political structure of society and poor governance has always benefited the rich in this country at the cost of poor. Every mega project benefits the privileged echelon and deprives the already deprived segments of society. Hence development initiatives of this scale always widens the gape between haves and have nots in the country thus results in increased social strain.

Citizens of Karachi enjoy very few recreational opportunities. Therefore developing coast for public recreation is not a bad idea as long as it provides equal opportunities of healthy recreation to every citizen. However waterfront development is not meant for ordinary citizen, it is only meant for elite who can afford access to expensive recreation.

Had development been the objective, government would have first invested to improve lives of people living in coastal village. These villages give a primitive look and by no means they look like a part of Karachi Metropolitan. During past sixty years, this country could not give them basic human facilities. Even the leading Urban NGOs working on poverty alleviation always preferred working in katchi abadies and very few worked for social uplift of communities in these villages.

Karachi city itself is a home to numerous problems and a large population lives life full of sufferings and miseries. Their development should be the first priority rather than investing billions to create dream islands for elite. The following facts about state of development in Karachi explain the reason for the need to revisit development priorities.

- Citizens do not receive adequate drinking water from pipelines and they pay 1.8 billion rupees to private tankers every year. (Dawn-24th June 07)
- 45% of drinking water is wasted due to poor infrastructure (Dawn-14th Feb 07)
- Karachi produces 9000 tons of garbage daily. Two third of which does not reach any ultimate disposal. (Dawn-22nd Nov 06)
- Karachi has only one snorkel of over 100 ft length to fight fire in high rises, which also remains out of order (Dawn-7th Jan 07).
- Karachi Fire Department had 74 tenders in 1995 and today it has only 20 tenders (Dawn-31st Aug 2007)
- 5,000 manholes are without cover in the city, posing threat to lives (Dawn-20th Sept 07)
- A low intensity rainfall inundates majority roads and streets of Karachi
- Karachi has been placed at 175th number out of 215 leading cities on quality of life index. In 2006 it was slightly better at 170th number. Delhi, Mumbai and Dhaka fared better than Karachi on this scale. (Dawn-2nd July 07)
- 29,400 mobile phones were snatched in Karachi during the first eight months of 2006 (Dawn, 16th Sept 06)
- During first nine months of 2006, total 8,800 cars and motor bikes were snatched/stolen in Karachi (Dawn-14th Oct 06)
- Karachi generates about 400 raw sewage every day out of which only 85 MGD is treated and over 300 million gallons of untreated sewage from Karachi is released to marine eco system on daily basis (25th April 07)
- Pollution at Karachi Harbor causes an annual loss of 1 billion dollars to Pakistan Navy.
- Air and water pollution have crossed national and international quality standards (Dawn-20th July 2006)

This list of grim facts can go virtually endless. While citizens are not getting even very basic human facilities, there is hardly any justification of investing huge amounts in luxurious projects. One can easily

guess the intentions behind these projects, which are only meant to create islands of prosperity in the ocean of deprivation and dejection.

Social development indicators particularly of health, education, drinking water and sewerage are pathetically poor in the country. In many social sector areas we lag behind SAARC countries and in some others even stand below the poor countries of Africa. Taking just an example of housing, the country needs 6.2 million new housing units to provide shelter to every citizen. Urban areas of Sindh require 135,000 new housing units to meet the present need and 200,000 units each year over a decade to clear the housing backlog. Rather than investing in housing for low income shelter less citizens, huge sum of money is being committed for ultra rich elite through such projects in the name of development. Has there been any genuine commitment with the development of people, huge investment would have been made to improve state of human development in rural and urban areas of Pakistan.

## 8. Future Scenario

Human greed has damaged the nature to alarming proportions. The degree of tempering with nature's balances has surpassed all limits and now it is the turn of nature to take its toll. Recent changes in climatic patterns have proved that development along the coast would be the most vulnerable.

It would be pertinent to quote here a report *Human tide: the real migration crisis* issued in May 2007 "Over a billion people, one in seven on earth could be forced from their homes between now and 2050 if the climate change worsens. Conflicts, large scale development projects and widespread environmental deterioration will combine to make life unsupportable for hundreds of millions of people mostly in Sahara belt, South Asia and the Middle East. Forced migration is now the most urgent threat facing poor people in the developing world. Over 155 million people are already displaced by conflicts, disasters and large scale projects"

Climate change has started manifesting in various shapes. Rising sea level, tsunamis and cyclones would make the problem acute if natural shields like mangroves are removed to create artificial islands and coastlines. Infrastructure and public services in Karachi can ill afford any natural calamity like cyclone. Over past two years moderate rains have brought disastrous impacts on city life. In May 1999 cyclone A 02 and in June 2007 cyclone Yemyin just passed by Karachi. These cyclones brought severe damage to life and property in Gujrat (India) and Balochistan. A fraction of that disaster would have played havoc with Karachi. Development along the coast needs to be carefully weighed against the possible climatic horrors. No matter how advanced technology is employed, development would still remain vulnerable to natural catastrophes. Preservation of natural eco system offers the most reliable shield against natural disasters. Karachi coast is being fast denuded from its precious mangroves cover, exposing the city to nature's wrath. Such madness in the name of development would pave the way for future disasters, impact of which would be beyond our imagination.

## References

- Kalmati Gul Hassan, *Karachi Sindh Jee Marui*, Kaachho Publication-Karachi, 2007
- Arif Hasan, *Understanding Karachi, Planning and Reform for the Future*, City Press-Karachi, 2002
- Arif Hasan, *The Scale and Causes of Urban Change in Pakistan*, Ushba Publishing Int. -Karachi,2006
- Human tide: the real migration crisis, A Christian Aid Report, May 2007
- David Crocker, *International Development Ethics*, University of Maryland at College Park
- Sidra Rafique, *The News-Karachi*, 25th May 2007
- Shahid Husian, *The News-Karachi*, 26<sup>th</sup> May 2007
- Planning and Development Department, Government of Sindh, *Request for Proposal, Development of Waterfront at Western Coastline of Karachi*, 2007